Y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad/ Standards of Conduct Committee S谜(5)-07-19 P3

Elin Jones AC, Llywydd

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

Elin Jones AM, Presiding Officer

National Assembly for Wales

Jayne Bryant AM
Chair, Standards of Conduct Committee
National Assembly for Wales
Cardiff Bay
CF99 1NA

Our ref: EJ/CS

07 May 2019

Dear Jayne

## **Update on Dignity and Respect**

On 1 April, the Assembly Commission considered a range of updates on the Assembly's Dignity and Respect work. In previous correspondence, we said that we would update the Committee on progress.

I am pleased to attach two reports for the Committee to note:

- The report on the mystery shopper exercise conducted at the end of 2018 in response to recommendation 8 of your report, Creating the Right Culture.
- An update table on the recommendations accepted by the Assembly Commission in response to your report.

I hope you will find that both reports provide assurance that a great deal of work to embed a culture of dignity and respect within the Assembly has been undertaken. You will note that further work is planned in the coming months – in particular the annual survey which will measure specifically whether individuals have experienced or observed inappropriate behaviour since we last surveyed them. Following that, we are planning a campaign which will update and recirculate information posters and raise further awareness as recommended by the Committee.

The Commission has noted the report of the mystery shopper exercise which again gave us assurance that the revised website pages introduced in May 2018

### Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

Bae Caerdydd, Caerdydd, CF99 1NA Llywydd@cynulliad.cymru www.cynulliad.cymru 0300 200 7403

### **National Assembly for Wales**

Cardiff Bay, Cardiff, CF99 1NA Llywydd@assembly.wales www.assembly.wales 0300 200 7403

are user friendly and accessible - something we appreciate the Committee wanted us to test.

As you are aware, since November we now have gender parity in the support provided to the independent Standards Commissioner. In addition to this we are pleased that we have been able to provide external expertise in relation to support and complaints about sexual harassment or sexually inappropriate behaviour. The Dignity and Respect guidance is being updated to reflect this provision and to guide potential complainants to the specialist support available. This additional support is being provided by the Survivor's Trust following a competitive tendering exercise.

In my letter of 30 October, I stated that we would consider the recommendation of the Committee on the potential for an anonymous reporting tool. We have explored this in further detail at the Commission meeting on 1 April following a visit to Cardiff University undertaken by officials in December 2018. Clearly there have been benefits to the University's cohort of some 31,000 students and they have devised a system that works for that institution.

Much of the service provided in that setting is provided at the Assembly by our Contact Officers. Conversations are confidential in nature and the report-back procedure to the Head of Human Resources who has a specific role to spot emerging patterns, is done anonymously. Formal complaints cannot be undertaken anonymously in either institution so that it is fair to all parties concerned.

The Commission has considered the most recent statistics relating to approaches to our Contact Officers since they were appointed in May 2018. We are pleased that this enhanced service is bedding down well and is clearly becoming a trusted service which imparts user-focused advice, guidance and emotional support.

However, we do not feel in a position to make a formal decision on the Committee's recommendation on anonymous reporting at this stage. The Commission has agreed to look again at this issue once the outcomes of the annual dignity and respect survey are known. We would also like to take account of any further work on party complaint procedures being undertaken by the



Standards Commissioner and any impact from the Committee's ongoing work on the code of conduct in coming to decisions about future reporting processes.

Once these areas of work are concluded, we aim to review all our policies and enhanced services to ensure that they remain fit for purpose and help us build the institutional culture that we have a shared interest in achieving.

Yours sincerely,

Elin Jones AM

Hin Jones

Llywydd



### **Mystery Shopper Survey**

In its report, Creating the Right Culture, the Committee on Standards of Conduct recommended to the Assembly Commission that it should undertake a mystery shopper exercise:

Recommendation 8. The Committee recommends that the Assembly Commission undertake a "mystery shopping" exercise on the existing material on how to make a complaint to ensure the available information is accessible and user friendly by end of 2018.

The Commission accepted that recommendation and a mystery shopping exercise was conducted between the 14 and 30 November. Based on the Committee's concerns we asked participants to navigate from the Assembly's home page to our Dignity and Respect pages, answer a number of scenarios to test the clarity of the information and asked for an assessment on terminology, accessibility and any other improvements we should think about for the future.

12 individuals were approach to take part and a total of 7 responses were received broken down as follows:

- 3 x external to the Assembly and based elsewhere in the UK
- 1 x Assembly Commission staff (Tŷ Hywel)
- 3 x Staff employed by Assembly Members (Tŷ Hywel and constituency offices)

Each of the questions are provided below together with a summary of the responses received and any action identified.

1. We wanted to test whether individuals could navigate from the Assembly's home page to our complaints pages.

On the Assembly's website www.assembly.wales we would like you to test whether, if you wished to make a complaint about inappropriate behaviour, you are able to navigate with relative ease to information on how to make such a complaint. Please provide any comments here:

Bae Caerdydd, Caerdydd, CF99 1NA Llywydd@cynulliad.cymru www.cynulliad.cymru 0300 200 7403

### **National Assembly for Wales**

Cardiff Bay, Cardiff, CF99 1NA Llywydd@assembly.wales www.assembly.wales 0300 200 7403

### Summary of responses

Three people said that it was easy to navigate from the Assembly's home page to our Dignity and Respect pages by using the 'complaints' tab at the bottom of the front page.

Four participants said that it took time, it was difficult to spot the 'complaints' tab or that our own 'search' function did not provide a clear route to the correct page.

Analysis: Searches inside our website for 'Dignity and Respect' provide accurate results but a search results for 'complaint' and 'Member complaint' are poor. Google searches for 'Assembly complaints', 'Assembly Member complaint' and 'complaints about Assembly Members' are reasonably accurate.

**Action**: We have made technical improvements to point searches on our website to the correct pages. Improvements to the architecture and search functions are already requirements for the website project and we will take the findings of the mystery shopper exercise into account.

2. As there are different complaints processes for the different groups of people who work here, and we heard feedback in 2017 stating that people wouldn't know how to complain or who to complain to, we wanted to test whether we had achieved our ambition to guide potential complainants to the relevant procedure in a relatively straightforward way. We also set a number of scenarios to test whether complainants understood the information provided.

Have we succeeded in making a fairly complex set of arrangements easy to access and follow? Please provide any comments you may have on whether these arrangements are easy to access.

**Summary**: Six participants said Yes and one said No. The majority stated that they were clear, easy to understand and presented in a straightforward way through using our drop-down guides. Suggestions for improvements included

(i) provision of links to connect an individual to whoever they are going to make a complaint to

(ii) a concern that the guidance in Welsh was text heavy and could be provided in bullet form.

**Action**: We have already committed to providing hyperlinks to political party complaint procedures once the Standards Commissioner has reviewed complaint procedures. In doing that, we will provide contact points. We plan to review our guidance later in the year and we will note the comment about the Welsh language version.

We set a number of scenarios to test whether we were providing clear, understandable information to guide individuals to the correct procedure:

If you were a media reporter and you had a complaint against an Assembly Member, describe the complaint route options available to you.

**Answer**: Report to the Assembly's Standards Commissioner, or to the political party's own complaint procedures.

All participants answered correctly.

If you are working at the Assembly fixing electric circuit boards under contract to the Assembly Commission and you decide to make a complaint about a member of staff who manages your contract for using racist language, who can you complain to?

**Answer**: Report to the Assembly's Human Resources Department or the Chief Executive and Clerk.

All participants answered correctly.

If you are employed by an Assembly Member and you wish to make a complaint against someone who works for another political group at the Assembly, what are the options available to you?

**Answer**: Report to the Members' Business Support Team who will raise this with the employing Member, or report to the political party's own procedures if that is your preference.

All participants answered correctly.

You do not work here, but in passing our estate a builder carrying out work on the Senedd building, makes sexist remarks at you, is it clear how you can make a formal complaint against them?

**Answer**: Report to the Head of Procurement or the Chief Executive and Clerk.

All participants answered correctly.

You are employed by an Assembly Member who you believe is subjecting you to bullying, and you wish to make a complaint. What are the options available to you and what support can you access?

**Answer**: Report directly to the Assembly's Standards Commissioner or report to the political party's own procedures.

All but one of the participants answered this correctly. One member of staff employed by an Assembly Member said that they would approach MBS or their trade union representative. However, even if initially the incorrect route was followed, we know that MBS or trade union colleagues would be able to signpost an individual to the correct route.

If you are unsure how to make a complaint, who should you get in touch with?

**Answer**: A Contact Officer or the helpline number 0800 020 9550.

All participants answered correctly.

3. We wanted to test whether we were using the correct language to ensure the use-friendliness of our information.

Terminology is important. However, it can get in the way when we describe subjects we are familiar with. Though we have endeavoured to present our webpages and information in an accessible and user-friendly way, did you have any observations on whether we have achieved our objective?

**Summary**: Participants found the information and language clear and easy to understand. One commented that it may be over-simplistic for employees.

4. We invited additional comments so that when we review our Dignity and Respect policy and guidance (most probably after the Committee on Standards of Conduct next reports), we could include further improvements.

At present, our Dignity and Respect policy and guidance are bedding down. The Standards of Conduct Committee is also continuing its work and will report again in the future. We will therefore need to review both the policy, guidance and any changes in practice later in 2019. We would therefore appreciate any other general observations you have that may not be caught by the specific questions above which we could take into account during that review.

**Summary**: Most of our participants did not comment further. However, a couple of useful suggestions were made for our further consideration:

- With so many options [to complain] it may be useful to have one document that captures all the information so that a person can print and read.
- There is no guidance on how to make a complaint about a Minister on the website or how that process is different to making a complaint against an AM
- Specific information for constituency offices would be useful especially when the employing Member is independent.

**Action**: We will consider these in the Dignity and Respect Working Group. These are all useful comments which could provide greater clarity for individuals before a formal review of the policy and guidance takes place later in 2019.

End



## Update on Standards of Conduct Committee's recommendations to the Assembly Commission

## Standards Commissioner's office

Recommendation	Progress
13. The Committee recommends	Contract awarded in February 2019 to
that the Assembly Commission work	the Survivor's Trust following a
with the Standards Commissioner to	competitive tendering exercise.  Contact details are being provided in our
develop a proposal for an advice and	dignity and respect guidance document
support function to sit alongside the	(with our Contact Officer details).
Commissioner's office by spring	
2019.	Two secondees appointed to the
	Commissioner's office (November 2018).
	Staff will assist Commissioner with fact-
	finding, investigative work and drafting,
	potentially shortening timeline for
	investigations. Gender balance achieved.

## Survey

Recommendation	Progress
1. The Committee recommends that	Annual Dignity and Respect Survey is
the Assembly Commission issue an	being prepared and will commence in
annual dignity and respect survey of	May 2019. It is taking into account all
AMs, AMSS and Commission staff	three of the Committee's
and present the findings and an	recommendations which have been
accompanying action plan to the	accepted.
Standards of Conduct Committee.	

## Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

Bae Caerdydd, Caerdydd, CF99 1NA Llywydd@cynulliad.cymru www.cynulliad.cymru 0300 200 7403

## **National Assembly for Wales**

Cardiff Bay, Cardiff, CF99 1NA Llywydd@assembly.wales www.assembly.wales 0300 200 7403

Recommendation	Progress
2. The Committee recommends that	
the Assembly Commission evaluates	
the dignity and respect survey of	
AMs, AMSS and Commission staff	
and develops it to identify types of	
inappropriate behaviour.	
10 . The Committee recommends	
that the annual dignity and respect	
survey and/or staff surveys include	
a series of questions around	
awareness of the Complaints	
procedure and processes.	

## Strengthening arrangements for contracts, leases and events

Recommendation	Progress
3. The Committee recommends that	We have met with all of our on-site
the Assembly Commission include	contractors, provided a copy of the policy
in leases and contracts for the use	and confirmed that they and their staff
of the Assembly estate the condition	will need to comply and abide with the
that organisations must have a/or	policy. They all confirmed agreement and
abide by the Assembly's dignity and	said they would be briefing staff as part
respect policy.	of their regular team meetings.
	GVA, as our Estates Advisers for sub-
	tenants have written to BBC and ITV to
	advise that we will include the
	requirement to comply with the Dignity

Recommendation	Progress
	and Respect policy in any future
	subleases. In the meantime, we have
	provided copies of the policy and
	confirmed our expectation that their
	employees based and working on our
	estate should comply with the policy and
	we highlighted the following extract for
	cascade and communication together
	with the policy:
	The policy states that the Assembly
	Commission expects anyone who uses
	our premises to respect those who work
	here and to uphold the high standards of
	conduct set out in this policy. If there are
	complaints about the conduct of anyone
	undertaking work at, or visiting, the
	National Assembly, constituency offices
	or wherever we are conducting business,
	the National Assembly will investigate
	and where appropriate, take these issues
	up with their employer. Where
	appropriate the Commission will report
	the matter to the police.
4. The Committee recommends that	Action completed. This is now built in to
an agreement to abide by the	terms and conditions documentation.

Recommendation	Progress
dignity and respect policy is	
included in any event booking.	

## **Professional Development**

Recommendation	Progress
5. The Committee recommends that	Completed. This is now built into our
training on Dignity and Respect in the	programmes.
workplace is included as part of the	The ACAS training is being offered to
induction process, and offered	AMSS at different locations across
periodically throughout the course of	Wales. E-learning is also available.
an Assembly.	
6. The Committee recommends that	Contract awarded to The Survivor's
the Assembly Commission offers	Trust in February 2019 after a
specific training around sexual	competitive tendering exercise. Initial
harassment and responding to	training for identified individuals
disclosures of sexual	arranged for spring/summer 2019.
violence/harassment, and that this is	
required training for identified	
individuals.	
7. The Committee recommends that	Completed. A package of training is
the Assembly Commission provides	available and is being taken up.
specific training for AMs on managing	We are developing this as a bilingual e-
a small office.	learning package over the coming
	months.

## Accessibility and user-friendliness of info

Recommendation	Progress
8. The Committee recommends that	Mystery shopper survey issued 14
the Assembly Commission undertake	November 2018. Positive results as
a "mystery shopping" exercise on the	shown in summary report.
existing material on how to make a	
complaint to ensure the available	
information is accessible and user	
friendly by end of 2018.	
11. The Committee recommends	We committed to do this as part of the
that each Party's policy is made	consultation process on the Dignity and
available on the Complaints page of	Respect policy. Once the Standards
the Assembly website, once the	Commissioner has completed his review
processes have been finalised.	on political party complaint procedures
	we will add them.
14. The Committee recommends	Commission will consider position after
that the Assembly Commission	the annual Dignity and Respect survey.
develops an online reporting tool	
which allows people to report	
incidents of inappropriate behaviour	
either anonymously or through a	
named disclosure by summer 2019.	

## **Promotion**

Recommendation	Notes
9. The Committee recommends that	Ongoing promotion has been taking
the Assembly Commission produce a	place throughout the year. Information
suite of information by spring 2019	is provided during induction and specific
relating to dignity and respect	dignity and respect awareness training
including leaflets, posters and online	including packs of information provided
content. This information must be	to delegates. In addition to posters in Tŷ
readily available for people to access	Hywel, they have been sent to
and should be informed by the	constituency offices. A new intranet
findings of the mystery shopping	video has been posted and further
exercise.	publicity will rolled out for our
	bystanders campaign in May and June.
20. The Committee recommends that	The campaign is planned for May and
an active bystander campaign	June 2019 with AM and staff involvement
relating to inappropriate behaviour is	in the weeks following the annual dignity
run on the Assembly estate, and that	and respect survey.
all Assembly Members are	
encouraged to sign up to.	



## **AMSS**

Recommendation	Notes
15. The Committee recommends	Completed by deadline. As a matter of
that the Assembly Commission put	course members of the AMSS
in place a method for notifying	representative group are notified of new
AMSS staff representatives about	starters in their political groups.
new starters in the Political group by	
October 2018.	
16. The Committee recommends	Completed. The Remuneration Board has
that the Assembly Commission work	agreed that a staff member, to represent
with the Remuneration Board to	staff employed by independent AMs,
bring forward a proposal by	should join the AMSS Reference Group
December 2018, on the support that	and a nomination has been sought. The
can be offered to AMSS working for	AMSS Operational Group membership
independent AMs.	now includes staff from independent
	offices. In line with the principle behind
	this recommendation, Members' Business
	Support has formalised the support
	network to assist AM offices with the
	transition to becoming independent from
	a political group.